

EFFECTS OF DATA COLLECTION METHODS ON ESTIMATED HOUSEHOLD CONSUMPTION AND POVERTY, AND ON SURVEY COSTS: EVIDENCE FROM AN EXPERIMENT IN THE MARSHALL ISLANDS

Discussion

IARIW conference



WORLD BANK GROUP

David Newhouse
Senior Economist
Poverty and Equity GP
December 23, 2019

Lots to like about this paper

- Convinced NSO to experiment with different collection methods
- Provides convincing evidence to substantiate growing call to move from diary to recall
 - Average consumption and poverty are generally similar for recall, PAPI diary, and CAPI diary
 - Except low-monitored PAPI diary gives substantially lower consumption / higher poverty estimates
- I'm sympathetic to overall argument that countries should move from diary to recall

Comments

- Is there strong evidence that diary-keeping surveys give data of worse quality than the status quo?
 - Highly monitored diaries appear to give similar results to recall
 - Status quo in the pacific is “somewhere between low and high-monitored diaries”
 - Diary fatigue could be balanced out by other benefits of (highly monitored) diaries such as more disaggregated information
- Strong argument that recall is a better option anyway
 - Because gives similar results at much lower cost

Comments

- Could tablets for a diary be provided directly to households?
 - Interviewer transcription costs are a key cost of CAPI diaries
 - Tablets are cheap (~\$35 at Walmart), small share of even cost of recall surveys (\$290 per household urban, \$580 rural)
 - Would this make diaries much cheaper than status quo PAPI or experimental CAPI by eliminating data entry costs?
 - Could tablet be made an incentive to keep up the diary?

Comments

- How robust are profiles to different methods of welfare data collection?
 - Are discrepancies between methods higher for different types of households?
- Can alternative welfare indicators be used to informally assess quality of different methods?
 - Presence of kids in school? Labor market outcomes? Share of food consumption? Asset ownership or purchase?

Minor comments

- **Choice of poverty line**
 - How much does choice of method affect extreme poverty rates?
 - Maybe try \$1.00 + half of median to be consistent with WB societal poverty line?
 - Would national poverty rate differ across methods if national poverty line was re-estimated?
- **Details**
 - How many EAs in experiment?
 - Were standard errors clustered on EA?

Where to go from here?

- What can NSO do to facilitate move from diary to recall?
 - What can be learned from experience of other countries who have made the switch?
- Can these experimental results be used to back out trends in the event of a switch?